How Can We Preserve and Protect University Place and Broadway?

The current lack of landmark and zoning protections along the University Place and Broadway corridors mean that Bowlmor Lanes (above left) is being torn down and will be replaced by a 23-story, 308 ft. tall tower. By comparison, NYU’s ‘mega-dorm’ on 12th Street between 3rd & 4th Avenues (above right) is only 250 ft. tall. Zoning for this area allows and encourages residential, hotel, and dorm construction of this height or greater. And the lack of landmark protections means historic buildings can be altered or destroyed at any time, with no public review or design approval for new construction or alterations – unlike in most of the rest of the Village.

Find out what can be done to change this:

Public Meeting
Thursday, December 4th at 6pm
Baha’i Center, 53 East 11th Street
AGENDA

• Discuss planned Bowlmor development
• Look at measures which could prevent *further future such developments*
• Answer questions about contextual rezoning and landmarking
• Gage stakeholder interest in and support for such measures
Bowlmor Site, 110 University Place
To be demolished and replaced with a 23-story, 52 unit, 308 ft. tall tower. 26 ft. high base covering most of the site, tower rising over approximately ¼ of site. Base will be lobby and some commercial and community facility uses. Tower will be residential, developer says it will be masonry. Does not require any special approvals or public review.
Allowable development in zoning districts around University Place and Broadway corridors

Could be residential, commercial (hotel), or community facility (dorm)
Why is this possible?
University Place/Broadway Corridor
Zoning Districts:

- Date to 1961
- Non-contextual/no height limits
- Encouraged tall towers surrounded by open space or low platforms
- Bonuses for “plazas”
- Some reflect historically commercial nature of part of area
- Incentives for “community facilities” (incl. dorms, other university facilities)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zoning District</th>
<th>Residential FAR</th>
<th>Commercial FAR</th>
<th>Community Facility FAR</th>
<th>Streetwall Height</th>
<th>Height Limit After Setbacks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C1-7</td>
<td>up to 6.02</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>none</td>
<td>none</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C6-1</td>
<td>up to 3.44</td>
<td>6.0 + up to 20% plaza bonus</td>
<td>6.5 + up to 20% plaza bonus</td>
<td>none</td>
<td>none</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C6-2</td>
<td>up to 6.02</td>
<td>6.0 + up to 20% plaza bonus</td>
<td>6.5 + up to 20% plaza bonus</td>
<td>none</td>
<td>none</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R7-2</td>
<td>up to 3.44</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>none</td>
<td>none</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Potential Solutions

- Historic District and landmark designation
- Contextual rezoning
GVSHP’s Recommendation:

• Seek a contextual rezoning AND expanded landmark/historic district designations
Why?

• Not guaranteed we’ll get either, or all of either
• Each one protects some aspects of what we value about the area, but not everything
• Successful model in our preservation efforts in Far West, East, and South Village
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zoning District</th>
<th>Residential FAR</th>
<th>Commercial FAR</th>
<th>Community Facility FAR</th>
<th>Streetwall Height</th>
<th>Height Limit After Setbacks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C1-7</td>
<td>up to 6.02</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>none</td>
<td>none</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C6-1</td>
<td>up to 3.44</td>
<td>6.0 + up to 20% plaza bonus</td>
<td>6.5 + up to 20% plaza bonus</td>
<td>none</td>
<td>none</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C6-2</td>
<td>up to 6.02</td>
<td>6.0 + up to 20% plaza bonus</td>
<td>6.5 + up to 20% plaza bonus</td>
<td>none</td>
<td>none</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R7-2</td>
<td>up to 3.44</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>none</td>
<td>none</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C1-7A (with incl. housing)</td>
<td>6.02 (5.4 &gt; 7.2)</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>60-85 ft.</td>
<td>120 ft.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C6-2A (with incl. housing)</td>
<td>6.02 (5.4 &gt; 7.2)</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>60-85 ft.</td>
<td>120 ft.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R7-A (with incl. housing)</td>
<td>4.0 (3.45 &gt; 4.6)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>40-65 ft.</td>
<td>80 ft.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Types of Buildings Permitted in R7-2 and C6-1 Zoning Districts

Left to Right: Residential building with an FAR of 3.44 on a large lot, residential building with a community facility FAR of 6.5 on a tenement-scale lot, and a commercial building on a small lot in a C6-1 district with a community facility FAR of 6.5
Types of Buildings Permitted in C1-7A, C6-2A (l.), and R7A (r.) Zoning Districts

- Above the maximum base height, building must be set back at least 10’ from the street wall when facing a wide street or 15’ when facing a narrow street.
- Base height: 60’ minimum, 85’ maximum.
- 120’ maximum building height.
- Off-street parking permitted only within or to the side of a building, never between the street wall and the street line.
- All open areas between the street wall and the street line must be planted.

8 Stories
6 Stories

6 Stories

East 9th Street
Avenue A
**Existing R7-2**

Community Facility FAR: 6.5

**Existing R7-2**

Residential FAR: 3.44

**Proposed R7A**

Residential FAR: 4.0
40'–65' Streetwall
80' Max Height
**Existing C6-1**

18 Stories
Comm. FAR: 6.0

**Existing C6-1**

19 Stories
Res. FAR: 3.44

2 Stories Commercial Base

**Proposed C6-2A**

12 Stories
Res. FAR: 7.2
(Inclusionary Housing Max.)
60'-85' Base, 120' max. ht.

8 Stories
High Rise vs. Low Rise

Height Factor Zoning
(e.g. R7-2)

- Tower (No Ht. Limit)
- Required Open Space

Contextual Zoning
(e.g. R7A; also "Quality Housing")

- Height Limit
- Street Wall
- Street

Diagram showing differences in zoning between high rise and low rise buildings.
What a contextual rezoning would do:

• Put height limits and envelopes in place
• Eliminate or greatly reduce likelihood of large-scale ‘commercial’ and ‘community facility’ construction, such as hotels, dorms, and other university facilities
What a contextual rezoning would NOT do:

• Require public hearings, review, or approval for new construction or exterior changes
• Affect design beyond the height and envelope
• Prohibit demolition of existing historic buildings
• Prohibit elimination or alteration of architecturally or historically significant features of existing buildings ("stripping," garish storefronts, etc.)
What landmarking or historic district designation would do:

• Require public hearings, review, or approval for any new construction, major exterior changes, or demolition

• Prevent demolition of existing historic buildings

• Prevent elimination or alteration of architecturally or historically significant features of existing buildings ("stripping," garish storefronts, etc.)
What would landmarking or historic district designation would NOT do:

• Affect uses (i.e. hotel, dorm, residential, commercial)

• Put in place specific height limits for new construction or additions (all changes would be subject to the judgment of the LPC)
What’s needed for a rezoning?

- Broad support from stakeholders
- Community Board support
- Local elected official support, especially the City Councilmember
- Department of City Planning agreement to take on the rezoning, and then approve it
- Borough President issues advisory opinion
- City Council must vote to approve

OR
Private rezoning application:

- Private entity files application, takes on the expense and burden of all filings
- *Still needs broad support from stakeholders*
- Community Board support
- *Local elected official support, especially the City Councilmember*
- City Planning Commission must still ultimately approve it
- *Borough President issues advisory opinion*
- City Council must vote to approve it
What’s needed for historic district designation?

• A strong argument for designation reflected in the history and architecture of buildings, backed up by research
• Broad support from stakeholders
• Community Board support
• Local elected official support, especially the City Councilmember
• Landmarks Preservation Commission must approve
• City Council must not overturn
Timing for a rezoning:

• Best case scenario – over a year
• In all likelihood, much longer

Timing for historic district designation:

• No time clock attached
• Realistically, a year or two at best, but likely much longer
PLEASE BE SURE TO FILL OUT AND DROP OFF THE FORMS BEFORE YOU LEAVE